

AREA PANELS	Agenda Item 18
	Brighton & Hove City Council

SUBJECT:		SPRINKLERS HIGH RISE BLOCKS	
Date:		July 2014	
Report of: Contract Compliance Manager		Property & Investment Team	
Contact Officer:	Name:	Theresa Youngman	Tel:
			293190
	Email:	Theresa.Youngman@brighton-hove.gov.uk	
Ward(s) affected:		All	

1. Summary of Request / Proposals

Further to the Lakanal House fire in July 2009 in which 6 people died & Shirley Towers fire in April 2010 in which 2 fire fighters died, which prompted Rule 43 letters from the coroners with recommendations on both that "Social housing providers should be encouraged to consider the retro-fitting of sprinklers in all existing high rise buildings in excess of 30 meters in height".

We have been approached by ESFRS with the offer to carry out pilots for the retro fitting of sprinkler systems and that they will match fund these projects. The first two high rise blocks in consideration for a pilot scheme are Somerset Point and St James House.

2. Considerations

Our considerations have been based around a 'Risk rating' matrix, provided by ESFRS, which identifies St James House as No 1, and Somerset Point being at No 4, in terms of being at highest risk within the context of all (50 no.) high rise blocks owned by Brighton and Hove City Council.

Somerset Point is a sheltered high rise block of 13 floors and 72 flats with 85 residents with an average age of 74. The main consideration is carrying out these works within the resident's flats, which will require pipes to be installed within the flat running to all habitable rooms with sprinkler heads, these will all be boxed in using a prefinished formed boxing. Communal areas will also be covered by the system. The initial costing for this block is approximately £86,400 with match funding from ESFRS the cost to BHCC would be £43,200.

St James House is a general needs high rise block of 16 floors and 120 flats, with 175 residents with an average age of 46. There are similar considerations with regards to installing the system within the block, but with the added complication that some of the flats will be leasehold. This being a larger and more complex building the initial costing for this

project is approximately £212,060 with match funding from ESFRS the cost to BHCC would be £106,030.

Summary of Considerations:

The cost to BHCC for the Pilot Project (2 blocks) is:

- St James House £106,030.00 (match funded by ESFRS)
- Somerset Point £ 43,200.00 (match funded by ESFRS)

There are many positives with installing a sprinkler system especially within high rise blocks. The system activates immediately and manually to suppress fires reducing damage to the fabric of the building and also weighs down deadly smoke particles—making the air safer for residents to breathe, and reducing deaths and injuries from smoke inhalation and fire. The Fire Service are actively promoting the installation of sprinklers as offering vicarious benefit in reducing the potential size of a fire and therefore offer better protection to the firefighting crews attending.

The only downside of fitting sprinkler systems is the initial costs of installing the equipment compared to a traditional fire alarm system. There is potential upheaval to the residents whilst building works are being carried out and also possible (minimal) disturbance of resident's decorations. There will also be some ongoing maintenance cost of approximately £250 pa for checking the function of the system.

The sprinkler installation at Somerset Point equates to £1152.79 per flat, added to the ongoing maintenance, the combined annualised cost per flat equates to £41.73 over 30 years. For St James House it equates to £1767.16 per flat with the combined maintenance and installation cost of £60.98 per flat over 30 years.

The council are at present installing a retro fit sprinkler system at The Glenwood Lodge Hostel in Grand Parade, at the time of this report they are still in the process of installing the pipe work around the building as the pictures below show, once this is complete the pipe work will be boxed in.



3. Current position

BHCC and ESFRS have had several meetings to discuss the need for retro fitting sprinklers within high rise blocks of flats. ESFRS have carried out desk top risk analysis on all High Rise Blocks within East Sussex (see Appendix A). St James House comes at the top of this list and Somerset Point is the highest sheltered block coming 4th overall. It is considered that Somerset Point being fully tenanted would be the best option to trial as a pilot and in the first instance using the guest flat as a show flat so that residents and other interested parties can consider the finished product will within a blueprint property. If this scheme is agreed, ESFRS and BHCC would then consult fully with all residents to inform and advise on the proposed programme of works.

If the pilot scheme is deemed to be successful, and the council decide to retro-fit sprinklers in all of the high rise and sheltered schemes the initial costing's at present would be approximately £2.9m over 50 schemes with possible additional costs for any associated building works. In addition the ongoing annual maintenance costs would be approximately £250 per block, and based on the 50 schemes this would equate to £12.5k per year.

4. Forward Planning – All High Rise blocks

Ideally ESFRS would like to see Sprinkler systems fitted in all high rise blocks, following the Rule 43 Coroners report. This would significantly enhance the safety of all residents within high rise blocks, these being of obvious higher risk of death or injury to residents in the event of an outbreak of fire. This also fits in with the Councils mission statement of 'Safeguarding the most vulnerable' and the Council's priority of 'Creating a more sustainable city'.

5. Recommendation

The recommendation is to carry out the pilot installation of the sprinkler system at Somerset Point, this being a block that is fully tenanted, thus mitigating any access problems. In addition, there are no section 20 requirements. This would then provide some guidance on making an informed decision on whether to proceed with St James House and then including other high rise throughout the city. This block is also the cheaper of the two options and with the match funding would be a cost effective scheme for a pilot.

Appendix 1:

Table of all high rise blocks within BHCC, and is broken down to show the risk rating of each block. We have factored in costing's for all blocks to be spread over the 30 year business plan (2 blocks per year = 25 years), thus providing a manageable budget allocation for retro-fitting all blocks across the designated period.

Appendix 2

3 Year financial projections showing cost implications to BHCC including initial outlay cost plus ongoing (accrued) Annual Maintenance costs.

Attachments:

Appendix 1: Risk Rating Matrix for all High Rise blocks across BHCC including costing's allocated across the 30 year business plan (excluding annual maintenance costs).

Appendix 2: 3 Year Financial Projections (including annual maintenance costs).

Sources:

East Sussex Fire and Rescue Services
Corporate Health & Safety Department – BHCC
Health & Safety Team – P&I, BHCC

Acknowledgements:

Jo Fowler, East Sussex Fire & Rescue Services
Richard Fowler, East Sussex Fire & Rescue Services
Mike Meik, Corporate Health & Safety Team
Brett Wells, H&S Team, P&I.

AREA PANELS

Agenda Item 18

Brighton & Hove City Council

Appendix 1

Site name	Flats	Total No. of floors	Sheltered Y/N?	Number of FDR1	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1	Risk Score2	Budget Cost for Sprinklers	Budget Allocation / Year
St James House, High Street, Brighton	120	16		16	2	4	10	69.20	£212,060	2014/15
Essex Place, Montague Street, Brighton	128	17		10	1	4	5	56.76	£153,600	2015/16
Wiltshire House, Lavender Street, Brighton	96	17		7	2	2	3	49.32	£115,200	2015/16
Somerset Point (Brighton), Somerset Street, Brighton	72	13	Y	9	1	1	7	47.04	£86,400	2014/15
Highleigh, Grove Hill, Brighton	45	12		6	2	3	1	41.40	£54,000	2016/17
Kestrel Court, 1-57 Swanborough Place, Brighton	57	11		5	2	3	0	41.27	£68,400	2016/17
Theobald House, Blackman Street, Brighton	110	19		7	1	1	5	40.90	£132,000	2017/18
Normanhurst, Grove Hill, Brighton	45	12		4	3	1	0	40.40	£54,000	2017/18
Falcon Court, 106-159 Swanborough Place, Brighton	54	10		6	2	0	4	29.40	£64,800	2018/19
Hereford Court (Brighton), Hereford Street, Brighton	96	17		4	0	2	2	28.32	£115,200	2018/19
Nettleton Court, Upper Hollingdean Road, Brighton	87	14		4	1	0	3	25.18	£104,400	2019/20
Dudene Lodge, Upper Hollingdean Road, Brighton	80	15		10	0	0	10	22.00	£96,000	2019/20
Courtlands, Ashton Rise, Brighton	46	13		3	0	3	0	20.98	£55,200	2020/21
Swallow Court, 1-54 Albourne Close, Brighton	54	10		6	0	2	4	19.40	£64,800	2020/21
Patching Lodge, Park Street, Brighton	76	7		5	1	0	4	19.32	£91,200	2021/22
Saxonbury, Ashton Rise, Brighton	45	12		3	1	0	2	17.40	£54,000	2021/22
Highcroft Lodge, Highcroft Villas, Brighton	35	7		9	0	1	8	15.45	£42,000	2022/23
Warwick Mount, Montague Street, Brighton	73	13		5	0	0	5	14.49	£87,600	2022/23
Goldstone House, Clarendon Road, Hove	57	10		3	0	1	2	12.70	£68,400	2023/24
Richmond Heights, John Street, Brighton	46	12		2	0	1	1	11.52	£55,200	2023/24

Kingfisher Court, 55 - 99 Albourne Close, Brighton	45	9		3	0	1	2	11.05	£54,000	2024/25
Barclay House, Wellington Road, Brighton	37	7		4	0	1	3	10.59	£44,400	2024/25
Livingstone House, Clarendon Road, Hove	54	10		5	0	0	5	10.40	£64,800	2025/26
St Johns Mount, Mount Pleasant, Brighton	74	14		0	0	0	0	10.36	£88,800	2025/26
37-72 Leach Court, Park Street, Brighton	36	7	Y	4	0	0	4	9.78	£43,200	2026/27
Tyson Place, Grosvenor Street, Brighton	74	13		0	0	0	0	9.62	£88,800	2026/27
1-36 Leach Court, Park Street, Brighton	36	7	Y	3	0	0	3	8.28	£43,200	2027/28
Thornsedale, Albion Hill, Brighton	45	12		2	0	0	2	7.40	£54,000	2027/28
Ellen House BN3 3WX	57	10		1	0	0	1	6.70	£68,400	2028/29
Ecclesden, Grove Hill, Brighton	46	11		1	0	0	1	6.06	£55,200	2028/29
Clarendon House, Clarendon Road Hove	57	10		0	0	0	0	5.70	£68,400	2029/30
Conway Court, Clarendon Road, Hove, Block 3 Flats 37-54					0	0	4	5.62	£21,600	2029/30
Heron Court, 58-105 Swanborough Place, Brighton	48	9		0	0	0	0	4.32	£57,600	2030/31
73-108 Leach Court, Park Street, Brighton	36	7	Y	0	0	0	0	3.78	£43,200	2030/31
Conway Court, Clarendon Road, Hove, Block 1 Flats 1-18					0	0	2	3.62	£21,600	2031/32
Conway Court, Clarendon Road, Hove, Block 2 Flats 19-36					0	0	2	3.62	£21,600	2031/32
Johnson Bank, Wellington Road, Brighton	37	7		1	0	0	1	3.59	£44,400	2032/33
Conway Court, Clarendon Road, Hove, Block 4 Flats 55-72					0	0	1	2.62	£21,600	2032/33
Napier House, Wellington Road, Brighton	37	7		0	0	0	0	2.59	£44,400	2033/34
Allamanda, 146 - 192 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2033/34
Calendula, 109-155 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2034/35
Cherry, 13-59 Bowring Way, Bristol Estate, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2034/35
Damson, 61-107 Bowring Way, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2035/36
Hazel, 1-24 Turton Close, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2035/36
Hollyhock, 206-252 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2036/37
Jasmine, 2 - 48 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2036/37

Meadowsweet, 74 - 120 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2037/38
Sorrel, 1-47 Chadborn Close, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2037/38
Viscaria, 61-107 Donald Hall Road, Brighton	24	7		0	0	0	0	1.68	£28,800	2038/39
									£2,943,600	25 Years

NB: The table above does shows only initial outlay costs for the installations; this does not include annual maintenance costs, which are shown in Appendix 2.

APPENDIX 2: Financial Projections over next 3 Years.

Financial Year	Site Name	Total budget cost	Match funded (if applicable)	Cost to BHCC	Annual Maintenance cost	Total Cost to BHCC @ year of installation	Accrual Cost over 3 years
2014/15	St James House, High Street, Brighton	£212,060	Y	£106,030	£250	£106,280	£106,280
2014/15	Somerset Point (Brighton), Somerset Street, Brighton	£86,400	Y	£43,200	£250	£43,450	£ 43,450
2015/16	Essex Place, Montague Street, Brighton	£153,600	Not decided	£153,600	£250	£153,850	£154,350
2015/16	Wiltshire House, Lavender Street, Brighton	£115,200	Not decided	£115,200	£250	£115,450	£115,950
2016/17	Highleigh, Grove Hill, Brighton	£54,000	Not decided	£54,000	£250	£54,250	£55,000
2016/17	Kestrel Court, 1-57 Swanborough Place, Brighton	£68,400	Not decided	£68,400	£250	£68,650	£69,400
						£541,930	£544,430